

Ken Skates AC / AM
Y Dirprwy Weinidog Diwylliant, Chwaraeon a Thwristiaeth
Deputy Minister for Culture, Sport and Tourism



Llywodraeth Cymru
Welsh Government

Eich cyf/Your ref
Ein cyf/Our ref

Christine Chapman AM
Chair
Communities, Equalities and
Local Government Committee

committeebusiness@Wales.gsi.gov.uk

28th July 2015

Dear Christine

Thank you for your letter of 15 June requesting updates on progress against Committee recommendations in my portfolio.

The attached annexes provide updates on each of the recommendations that were accepted or accepted in principle by the Welsh Government:

Public libraries in Wales – Annex 1
Participation levels in sport – Annex 2
Welsh Government's historic environment policy – Annex 3
Participation in the Arts in Wales – Annex 4
Welsh Premier League – Annex 5
The future outlook for the media in Wales – Annex 6

*Yours ever,
Ken*

Ken Skates AC / AM
Y Dirprwy Weinidog Diwylliant, Chwaraeon a Thwristiaeth
Deputy Minister for Culture, Sport and Tourism

Public libraries in Wales

Recommendation 1 (Accepted): We recommend that the Minister produces and publishes an annual report on the state of public libraries in Wales.

Update: An annual report, which will also include academic libraries, will be produced by 30 April 2016 covering the period April 2015-March 2016.

Recommendation 2 (Accepted): We recommend that the Minister makes arrangements for the central publication of disaggregated data showing the use of public libraries by demographic groups.

Update: We are seeking to include use of public libraries within the Wales National Survey for 2016-17 which would then provide information on use by geographic area.

Recommendation 3 (Accepted): We recommend that the Minister works with partners to develop a contemporary definition of “comprehensive and efficient” library services for local authorities to deliver under the Public Libraries and Museums Act 1964. Such a definition should include the provision of internet access which, we believe, should remain free of charge.

Update: The provision of free Internet access is included in the Welsh Public Libraries Standards 2014-17 as one of the core entitlements. We are looking at the longer term legislative changes that would be required to progress a new Libraries Act for Wales.

Recommendation 4 (Accepted in Principle): We recommend that the Minister considers developing a voluntary accreditation scheme for individual libraries in Wales.

Update: This recommendation was accepted in principle. However, the WPLS Framework will be the mechanism to progress this action.

Three recommendations (4, 8 and 9) of the *Expert Review* have been completed which progress this issue. A piece of research has been published which reviewed the current situation of community (volunteer) managed libraries in Wales. This was followed by publication of *Guidance on Community Managed Libraries and the Statutory Provision of Public Library Services in Wales* in May 2015, which was agreed by the Welsh Local Government Association and the Welsh Government. The *Guidance* seeks to ensure that such libraries should be striving to achieve the 18 core entitlements as per the Welsh Public Library Standards in order to deliver a quality service.

Recommendation 5 (Accepted): We recommend that the Minister continues to work with local authorities and their partners to identify and promote further opportunities for collaboration and co-location arrangements in the delivery of library services.

Update: Applications for the 2015-16 capital funding from the Welsh Government Community Learning Libraries Programme were required to support co-located services. This stipulation is likely to remain in place for future funding rounds.

Recommendation 6 (Accepted): We recommend that the Minister ensures that the necessary ongoing support and guidance is available in order to increase the long-term sustainability of community managed libraries.

Update: Research has been published which reviewed the current situation of community (volunteer) managed libraries in Wales (*Independent Trust and Community Libraries in Wales*) report. This was followed by publication of *Guidance on Community Managed Libraries and the Statutory Provision of Public Library Services in Wales* in May 2015.

In addition, a toolkit on community managed libraries has been produced by Conwy CBC in partnership with the Welsh Government and has been made available to public libraries in Wales. The toolkit represents best practice in how to develop and sustain community managed libraries.

Recommendation 7 (Accepted): We recommend that the Minister ensures adequate support and guidance continues to be available to local authorities to identify and pursue all available funding opportunities.

Update: A document with useful links and information has been produced and made available to library staff in Wales.

Recommendation 8 (Accepted): We recommend that, whilst core library services should remain free of charge, the Minister should explore with local authorities all other available options for libraries to raise revenue.

Update: All library services in Wales are encouraged to develop partnerships which support the cost of core statutory services, including the sharing of buildings and staff between different community services.

Recommendation 9 (Accepted): We recommend that the Minister works with local authorities and partners to promote better the wide range of services provided by public libraries.

Update: *Libraries Inspire*, the current library strategy for Wales, includes 'Attracting the audience' as a strand of work. This work strand is led by a team in Wrexham CBC and delivers support to all Welsh library services. Activities include co-ordinating national events, promoting initiatives, social media engagement, press releases, infographics, staff development, co-ordinating all-Wales promotion of services, and contributing towards the Welshlibraries.org website.

Recommendation 10 (Accepted): We recommend that the Minister continues to pursue the case for additional funding from the UK Government in recognition of the increasing responsibilities for library staff in Wales in supporting the delivery of digital-by-default welfare reforms.

Update: Ongoing discussions continue to support libraries in delivering services to address digital inclusion.

Participation levels in sport

Recommendation 1 (Accepted): We recommend that the Minister publishes the joint delivery plan produced by Sport Wales and Public Health Wales, along with a timetable for its implementation. This should include agreed outcomes by which the success of the plan will be measured.

Update: We are addressing physical activity specifically through the Ministerial led Physical Activity Executive Group (PAEG) which is seeking to improve levels of activity in Wales through a co-ordinated, cross Government approach; working with partner organisations such as Public Health Wales and Sports Wales. The Group are currently developing a pan Wales physical activity plan, building on the work of Creating an Active Wales, which gained full Cabinet support in December 2014.

A Physical Activity and Health Programme Director, jointly funded by Welsh Government, Sport Wales and Public Health Wales has recently been appointed by the group to support the work of PAEG and specifically the development and implementation of the action plan. The role will also require the individual to develop and sustain effective working relationships with all key partners and stakeholders.

Sport Wales and NHS Confederation have developed a Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) which demonstrates a commitment from both sectors to come together to promote healthier living and improve the health and wellbeing of the people of Wales.

The MOU - which will initially cover the next three years - sets out six areas of cooperation which include:

- work together to support the people of Wales to enjoy more active, more equal and healthier lives
- work to encourage people to look after their own health and thereby take care of the health of future generations
- work to foster a co-productive relationship with the people of Wales
- work together to support the drive for a mass shift in public thinking about their health
- exchange information of mutual interest
- seek to develop joint areas of work that promote 'sport for all' and encourage participation across the life span.

Recommendation 2 (Accepted): We recommend that the Minister undertakes a review of all existing sources of data that measure participation levels in sport, including the methodology used in Sport Wales surveys. The Minister's review should focus on addressing the concerns around the lack of data on how deprivation, demographics, protected characteristics and cultural barriers impact on participation levels. Any improvements that relate to the work of Sport Wales should be reflected in its future annual Remit Letters.

Update: We have now developed a unified, national survey which will involve Sport Wales and other stakeholders and will incorporate data on active adults to provide a more rounded picture. Sport Wales, as a provider of statistical information, has been fully involved in the development of questions related to sport and physical activity. The national survey will feature as a priority within the Sport Wales Strategic Equality Plan 2016-2020.

Recommendation 3 (Accepted): In relation to BME communities, we recommend that the Minister works with Sport Wales and relevant organisations to identify alternative and more effective means of data collection on levels of participation in sport within these communities.

Update: The new national survey will provide opportunities for more effective ways of data collection on levels of participation in BME communities. However, there are limitations to this approach given the relatively small size of the BME population in Wales.

Sport Wales has worked with the BME taskforce to develop networks in Swansea, Cardiff and Newport. Sport Wales have also commissioned research to identify the barriers to participation in sport by BME communities. Each of the networks have been awarded 'kick start funding', which has been utilised to support grass root sport development within BME Communities.

The Cardiff BME Network undertook a task and finish exercise to better understand the barriers facing BME Women in participating in sport.

This will feature as a priority within the Sport Wales Strategic Equality Plan 2016-2020.

Recommendation 5 (Accepted): We recommend that the Minister works with Sport Wales to define and publish the outcomes by which the success of its Community Sport Strategy and Child Poverty Strategy will be measured. We further recommend that robust arrangements are put in place to monitor and evaluate the success of these Strategies, and to understand their impact on participation levels.

Update: Sport Wales is currently developing a new Community Sport Strategy which is underpinned by an **outcomes based investment framework**. This new framework will put the needs of the participant and potential participant at the forefront of our planning. Once introduced all partners will be measured against their contribution towards achieving these **3 key outcomes**:

- to increase the frequency of regular participation in sport - 'Hooked on Sport'
- to target inequalities in participation and provide greater support to those where barriers to regular participation exist
- to develop and enhance the 'Sporting Pathway' so that it provides high quality opportunities for all and allows our most talented athletes to realise their potential.

These three key 'goals' are being developed within the context of the goals contained within the 'Wellbeing and Future Generations Act' which forms the basis of Sport Wales' current remit letter.

A **revised model of delivery** will also be introduced alongside this new investment framework. The model will have effective sector collaboration at the heart of its approach, with local, regional and national partners all working together for maximum impact on sport, creating a connected sports sector, something that is missing from the existing delivery model. It will clarify the roles and responsibilities of each partner and seek to make best use of their knowledge and skills, and importantly produce a long term, sustainable model.

Sport Wales's current Child Poverty Strategy is due to be reviewed and evaluated towards the end of 2015. A long term outcome of the strategy is: To see an increase in participation amongst children and young people living in poverty, contributing to Sport Wales' wider aspiration of all children and young people being hooked on sport for life.

The Sport Wales School Sport survey is the largest of its kind in the world. Since 2011, the School Sport Survey has captured frequency of participation, allowing them to explore the

number of occasions per week pupils take part in organised sport and recreation, outside of the curriculum.

In the survey, 'Receipt of a free school meal' is used as a proxy measure of the socio-economic status of school children in Wales. Using data provided from the Welsh Government Pupil Level Annual School Census⁴, schools in the survey are placed into a Free School Meal (FSM) quartile. FSM quartile 1 has a low percentage of pupils who are eligible for a free school meal and FSM 4 has a high percentage of pupils who are eligible, and can be considered relatively more deprived. Figure 1 below shows the percentage of pupils who are hooked in sport according to the FSM quartile they are in.

	2011	2013	% Difference
FSM 1	34	46	+12
FSM 2	29	41	+2
FSM 3	24	39	+15
FSM 4	25	35	+10

The data indicates that there has been a significant increase in the numbers of underprivileged children who are participating in sport. The 2015 School Sport Survey is currently underway and the results will likely published in November.

Recommendation 6 (Accepted): We recommend that the Minister works with Sport Wales to put in place a programme to identify and subsequently address the barriers to participation in sport that are specific to people from BME backgrounds. This should include undertaking research to better understand what these barriers are.

Update: Sport Wales will imminently be publishing a report on the barriers to participation of BME Communities in sport. Undertaken by Leeds University, the report provides a qualitative examination of the challenges faced by members of the BME community in Wales in accessing and participating in sport. Sport Wales will be engaging with BME leaders on how the outcomes of this research can be taken forward for implementation at a community level.

Recommendation 7 (Accepted): We recommend that the Minister publishes an action plan setting out how he intends to improve participation levels among people in BME communities. This should include a set of measureable outcomes.

Update: This is one of Sport Wales' equality objectives, and as such action has been included within Sport Wales' equality action plan. This includes Calls for Action funding and the development of BME networks. BME participation in sport is a priority for Sport Wales grants as part of tackling inequities and Sport Wales has invited the WCVA to lead a piece of work to develop a Business Plan, which will recommend an approach (Framework) to promoting sport, increasing participation and improving access to sport within BME Communities. Community ownership and sustainability will be a main focus. The framework will consider insight from the BME Research and will reflect on current infrastructure. WCVA have established a high level steering group which has representation from BME Sector Organisations, YMCA and the Sports Sector. Sport Wales has set a timescale for completion of this work by September 1st 2015.

Recommendation 8 (Accepted): We recommend the Minister ensures that further work is undertaken to identify ways to encourage girls to participate in sport. This should include research into the types of sport or activities that appeal specifically to girls, and the factors affecting their participation.

Update: Sport Wales's research team have produced a factsheet on the data around women & girls' participation in sport to inform the funding criteria for Calls 4 Action. This funding stream prioritises support for women & girls, BME, disability and areas of deprivation. Sport Wales invested £2.35 million in Calls for Action funding this year, including:

- Girl Guiding Cymru (national project) - £240,439
- Welsh Cycling (national project) - £249,342 to encourage women of all ages into cycling
- Welsh Gymnastics (Cardiff-based) - £157,089 to encourage participation of BME girls into gymnastics
- Us Girls Wales (delivered by StreetGames) -£690,000.

With the £690,000 they will receive, StreetGames aims to establish an 'Us Girls' movement across Wales, delivering a new and exciting programme aimed at increasing engagement of inactive and semi-inactive 13-19 year old girls and young women living in disadvantaged communities across Wales. The Us Girls Wales Programme will work closely with Communities First to develop a diverse network of organisations to help mobilise 5,000 girls across Wales over the next two years.

Recommendation 10 (Accepted): We recommend that the Minister and Sport Wales work with local authorities to identify opportunities to increase and improve access to leisure facilities across Wales.

Update: Following the Welsh Government Conference on Leisure Services for Physical Activity on 18 September 2014, we have committed to working with local authorities to mitigate the loss of sports and leisure centres. As part of this, we launched a Community Asset Transfer Toolkit for Community Groups and organisations on 26 February 2015. Also, in March 2015, a new £5 million pilot Sport Facilities Capital Loan Scheme was launched for local authorities to refurbish or develop new sport and recreation facilities.

In addition, Sport Wales in partnership with Welsh Government has commissioned work to establish a "Vision for Sport facilities in Wales". The work is supported by the officers from local authorities, the WLGA and National Governing Bodies of Sport. It also endorses the work of the Wales Collaborative Sports Facilities Group (Welsh Rugby Union, Hockey Wales and Football Association of Wales) in relation to a vision of Artificial Turf Pitches in Wales.

The work is currently underway and is due to produce a final report during summer 2015. The core purpose of this work is:

- To provide a clear vision, rationale and guiding principles to support those responsible for decisions on the provision of sport and physical recreation facilities in Wales so that a landscape of appropriate, fit for purpose, fit for the future and sustainable facilities may be created.
- To recognise the issues facing providers and funding bodies as well as the steps being taken to safeguard essential facilities i.e. using 'spend to save' investment; asset transfers; and accessing capital funds
- To provide messages and tools to assist politicians and decision makers in informing cross-government policies
- To identify requirements for further and future action.

Recommendation 11 (Accepted): We recommend that the Minister undertake a review of the Free Swimming Scheme in order to identify areas where take-up is low and the reasons for this, and report back to us on his findings.

Update: The Welsh Government commissioned Sport Wales to review the Free Swimming Initiative (FSI) with a view to improving take up and cost effectiveness. Following the review, the Deputy Minister for Culture, Sport and Tourism considered the report of the Aquatics Group, which is a joint group, made up of representatives from Sport Wales, Swim Wales and some local authorities, and decided that the funding formula should be amended. This was done in order to more effectively target children in deprived areas.

Recommendation 12 (Accepted in Principle):

We further recommend that the Minister works with local authorities to address the variance in the provision of free swimming across Wales. The Minister should also publish an action plan setting out how he intends to increase the number of children under the age of 11 who can swim.

Update: A new Aquatics report card has been developed by the Aquatics Group for Local Authorities for 2014-18 which prioritises:

- Making every child a Swimmer when they leave KS2 (%)– Measured using Aqua Passport Wales Learn to Swim Framework – Level 4 – 90% by 2018
 - Every KS2 child learning to swim through high quality swimming lessons
 - Aligned resources across FSI, education and leisure
 - Consistent delivery and assessment against the Wales Learn to Swim Framework throughout Wales
- Delivery of the minimum criteria for the Free Swimming Initiative (FSI) will still enable the continuation of more structured swimming opportunities.

Welsh Government's historic environment policy

Recommendation 1(Accepted): The Committee recommends that before proceeding with any merger involving the Royal Commission on the Ancient and Historical Monuments of Wales, the Minister should give full consideration to the concerns raised by expert witnesses during the course of our inquiry.

Update: On 14 January 2014, the then Minister for Culture and Sport announced in Plenary his decision not to merge Cadw and the Royal Commission on the Ancient and Historical Monuments of Wales. In coming to his decision, the Minister had regard to the views expressed during the consultation which formed part of *the future of our past* consultation. He also took into account the views expressed by witnesses and Communities, Equalities and Local Government Committee members during the course of its inquiry.

Recommendation 2 (Accepted): The Committee recommends the Welsh Government should explore options to strengthen the status of the Historic Environment Records, including putting them on a statutory footing.

Update: One of the provisions in the Historic Environment (Wales) Bill is to place a duty on local planning authorities to create and keep up to date a historic environment record either directly or through the agency of another person or organisation.

Recommendation 3 (Accepted): The Committee recommends the Welsh Government should explore options to simplify the listing system.

Update: The consultation, *the future of our past*, included six proposals for improvements to the listed building consent process. There was no clear consensus forthcoming from consultation responses on the improvements needed. To augment the evidence obtained from the consultation, Cadw commissioned Hyder consulting Ltd, to undertake a study: 'Refining the listed building consent process', to examine the strengths and weaknesses of the current process. As a result of this study new policy, advice and guidance has been developed that complements the Historic Environment (Wales) Bill and which will help local planning authorities and owners in the preparation and quicker determination of listed building consent applications. The draft technical advice note for the historic environment and the guidance on managing change to listed buildings and applying for listed building consent, which has been published alongside the Bill, will introduce greater flexibility and clarity into the process.

Recommendation 4 (Accepted): The Committee recommends the Welsh Government should ensure that Local Authorities are applying and enforcing rules around listings consistently.

Update: As part of the package of measures to support the Historic Environment (Wales) Bill a draft of the historic environment chapter of Planning Policy Wales, a draft technical advice note and draft guidance on managing change to listed buildings have been published. These documents will assist in delivering greater consistency across Wales. Furthermore, the role of the Cadw regional inspectors of historic buildings seeks to foster a consistent approach to the management of listed buildings across Wales. Cadw also hosts the Built Heritage Forum which brings together conservation officers from local authorities across Wales. This forum provides an opportunity for the exchange of views on subjects/issues and to agree future actions for partners. Cadw is also represented at the regional conservation officers' fora and again this

enables good practice and ideas to be shared and helps foster a more consistent approach to issues such as enforcement action.

Recommendation 5 (Accepted in Principle): The Committee recommends the Welsh Government should explore options to introduce a statutory timescale for the review of listed properties or buildings, taking into account sustainability and usage.

Update: An all-Wales resurvey of listed buildings was completed in 2005. This was a comprehensive exercise to bring the lists of buildings of special architectural or historic interest in Wales up-to-date, using expert advisors to carry out assessments according to consistent criteria. There are no plans for a further full resurvey which would be resource intensive and very expensive. However, there are mechanisms in place both to add buildings to the List (through spot-listing), and also to remove them from it (through de-listing). Officials in Cadw continue to respond to requests to review past decisions on listing in light of new evidence.

Recommendation 6 (Accepted): The Committee recommends the Welsh Government should explore options to introduce a system so that, where local authority searches show that a building is listed and/or in a conservation area, the new owner is provided by the local authority with clear guidance concerning restrictions and responsibilities associated with the listed status.

Update: Cadw is preparing a guidance document that will focus on assisting owners to understand the significance of their buildings and their responsibilities. Local Planning Authorities will have access to this document, and will be encouraged to disseminate to new owners.

Recommendation 7 (Accepted in Principle): The Committee recommends the Welsh Government should introduce a system to ascertain, at the point of sale/transfer, whether there has been any violation of listed building regulations and to gather information on the condition of the building.

Update: There are already mechanisms in place to enable local planning authorities and Welsh Ministers to ascertain whether there has been any violation of a listed building regulation. Some local authorities visit listed buildings with potential buyers to provide reassurance that the correct authorisation for any works has been received.

They are currently able to charge for such a service as section 93 of the Local Government Act 2003 provides that authority may charge a person for providing a service to him if-

- (a) the authority is authorised (but not required) to provide the service; and
- (b) the person has agreed to the provision of the service.

Recommendation 8 (Accepted in Principle): The Committee recommends the Welsh Government should explore the introduction of a mechanism so that, following work to a listed building, a listed building appraisal should be undertaken within a specified timeframe.

Update: The listed building consent process is intended to provide a framework for managing change to listed buildings that protects their character as buildings of special architectural or historic interest. In granting consent, local authorities have the power to impose conditions, which are necessary, relevant, enforceable, precise and reasonable. The onus is on the owner to carry out the work in accordance with the conditions of the consent, as failure to do so will be a criminal offence. When faced with a breach of listed building control, local authorities will need to consider whether to take enforcement action or to prosecute, or both.

Recommendation 9 (Accepted in Principle): The Committee recommends the Welsh Government should take steps to introduce a statutory register for historic parks and gardens, so that they are fully protected within the planning system.

Update: One of the provisions in the Historic Environment (Wales) Bill is to place a statutory duty upon the Welsh Ministers to create and maintain a register of historic parks and gardens in Wales.

This recommendation has subsequently been accepted in full.

Recommendation 10 (Accepted): The Committee recommends that the Welsh Government should put in place mechanisms to ensure better collaboration in promoting the historic environment.

Update: The Historic Environment Strategy for Wales identified public participation, understanding and enjoyment of heritage, and realising economic benefit through tourism as two priority areas that can support sustainable development and improved life-chances, and contribute to the Welsh Government's aspirations to tackle poverty. Our stakeholder group on the historic environment provides an excellent forum for collaboration around these themes. Key partners on this group include Amgueddfa Cymru-National Museum Wales, the four Welsh Archaeological Trusts, the Royal Commission on Ancient and Historic Monuments in Wales, Civic Trust Cymru and the National Trust, all of whom are involved in making the historic environment accessible and stimulating to visitors.

A number of specific measures to cross promote other heritage sites have already been implemented, including:

- the inclusion of non-Cadw properties on Cadw leaflets;
- use of the Cadw website and social media; itineraries to encourage people to visit other, nearby sites; promotion to the travel trade as well as the general public;
- collaboration on summer shows and special promotions offering reciprocal discounts for visitors to heritage sites and museums.

Other initiatives include:

- Open Doors - working with a range of bodies, groups and owners to allow public access to the historic buildings not normally accessible, or which usually charge admission. In 2014, Open Doors, run in-house for first time, ran 1,000 events at 343 properties in Wales, attracting 34,000 visitors and facilitated by 2,500 volunteers.
- Tourism promotion and visitor research in collaboration with Visit Wales.
- Events - Cadw runs more than 500 events and days out across Wales, including participative activities at sites and summer shows, tours, talks, living history and live performances.

Recommendation 12 (Accepted): The Committee recommends that the Welsh Government should explore the possibility of establishing a national membership-based heritage organisation, in order to promote historic sites.

Update: Cadw and the National Trust – already have a wide membership base. They are in active discussions about how they can maximise the opportunities that this offers. Our stakeholder group on the historic environment brings together these and other national or regional organisations with a role to play – such as Visit Wales, National Museum Wales,

Glandŵr Cymru, the National Parks, the Heritage Lottery Fund, the Royal Commission and the Welsh Archaeological Trusts – with a commitment to promote the sector, engage the public, benefit local groups and museums, and provide mutual support and cross-promotion. Recommendation 14 deals with the establishment of an informal heritage alliance which will also positively promote sites.

Recommendation 13 (Accepted): The Committee recommends that the Welsh Government should ensure that Cadw prioritises accessibility to its sites, and ensures its approach is consistent.

Update: Cadw continues to take steps to ensure that historic sites are physically and intellectually accessible and enjoyable to visit both for visitors and people who live in Wales. It also targets hard to reach audiences. Examples of work that is underway include:

- Provision of facilities that support visitors with protected characteristics such as disability or age.
- Free or reduced admission to Cadw sites for a range of groups - including people with physical, sensory and mental health problems, and their carers (13,520 visitors in 2014-15), senior citizens (119,149 visitors in 2014-15) and learning visits (89,174 visitors in 2014-15).
- Visitor research - to understand the profile, attitudes and motivations of its current visitor base. This informs Cadw's policy on access by under-represented groups.
- Cadw is working in partnership with Action for Children to remove financial barriers to visiting sites in Cadw's care for cared for children and the families caring for them, by giving free admission to foster families through a foster families membership scheme. The aim of the scheme is to help disadvantaged young people understand their local and national heritage and culture – and use some of Wales's most stunning heritage sites to relax, undertake therapeutic work, hold events and have fun.
- The Heritage Tourism Project - enhancing access, understanding and enjoyment by providing modern visitor facilities and contemporary interpretation using new technologies, art and living history re-enactments. The new interpretation is focused primarily on family visits and activities, with additional provision for school parties and specialist interests. Major projects include St David's Bishop's Palace, Harlech, Caernarfon and Denbigh castles and Blaenavon Ironworks.
- At Harlech Castle, a 45 metre bridge, linking the new visitor terrace with the castle's gatehouse has been installed. The bridge has enabled level access to the gatehouse, allowing access to the castle in the way it was first intended when it was built 600 year ago.
- A programme of events that is intended to appeal to and attract additional visitors to the sites.

Recommendation 14 (Accepted): The Committee recommends the Welsh Government should explore the possibility of establishing a representative umbrella body, such as English Heritage, to represent non-Government organisations in the third and private sectors.

Update: An analysis of the structure, resilience and capacity of the third sector in Wales and an investigation of the potential for new support structures, such as a membership-based Welsh heritage network commissioned by Cadw, was published in March 2014. The report recommended the establishment of an 'informal alliance' of third sector organisations and identified a need for development officers to support building preservation trusts.

As a result, the Welsh Government through Cadw is funding Civic Trust Cymru to lead on the development of a new Wales Heritage Group. Cadw has also been discussing proposals for regional development officers to support existing Welsh Building Trusts and help establish new ones with the UK Association of Building Preservation Trusts and other key partners. It is anticipated that this will culminate in a bid to the Heritage Lottery Fund shortly.

Participation in the Arts in Wales

Recommendation 1 (Accepted in Principle): The Welsh Government should put in place a participation action plan, to sit alongside its accessibility action plan, with the purpose of increasing participation levels across Wales.

Update: A final version of the Action Plan was agreed in September 2013. Work continues to be monitored at Quarterly Monitoring Meetings. Progress will be reported to the Communities, Equality and Local Government Committee annually.

Recommendation 2 (Accepted): The action plan should include measures to monitor participation levels across the arts, and actions to identify inequality of provision (e.g. due to geographic, economic or social reasons).

Update: ACW's current monitoring includes:

1. The RFO survey, reporting twice a year on attendance and participation levels by its revenue funded organisations.
2. The Adult and Children's Omnibus surveys, undertaken annually.
3. Quarterly monitoring of Lottery funded projects, including participatory activity.
4. Wales Arts Review – a large scale survey of participation and attendance in the arts across Wales, undertaken every five years.

ACW has developed a new system for monitoring project funded activity that can also report on geographic, economic and social breakdown.

Recommendation 3 (Accepted): In addition to accessibility and equality, the Welsh Government's annual remit letter should include an emphasis on increasing participation levels.

Update: As in 2013-14, the 2014/15 Remit Letter highlights the need to continue with efforts to increase participation levels, despite the difficulties caused by the current financial climate and pressures on funding. Increasing participation in the arts remains a standing requirement in ACW's funding agreement with its RFOs.

Recommendation 4 (Accepted): The action plan should include measures to ensure co-ordination across government departments and joint working by partners, including local government and the voluntary sector.

Update: Creative Economy (Arts) officials have undertaken an exercise in collaboration with colleagues in other Departments, to identify existing and new initiatives that do or could support increased participation in the arts.

Work continues within Cadw, through initiatives such as the Artists in Residence scheme. Similarly Amgueddfa Cymru/ National Museum runs participatory activities during school holidays to encourage young people to develop an interest in arts and culture.

ACW has commissioned Voluntary Arts Wales to undertake a programme aimed at increasing and sustaining voluntary arts activity in areas of Wales where there is low take up.

ACW is also delivering its 'Momentum' programme in partnership with the Welsh Government Communities First team; this is aimed at engaging young people - who are NEET or at risk of this - with the Arts.

Recommendation 5 (Accepted): The Arts Council of Wales should keep under review its funding policies, to ensure that they are delivering excellence, while increasing participation levels.

Update: ACW staff currently review and report to sponsor division and to ACW Council on a quarterly basis, and undertake a full review at the year end.

Recommendation 6 (Accepted): The Arts Council of Wales should ensure that organisations are able to access information on alternative sources of funding. This should be in the form of training, if necessary.

Update: Information about trusts and foundations is included in ACW's funding guidelines, available on its website. ACW runs funding surgeries across Wales providing information, help and support on accessing its Lottery funding.

ACW is exploring the possibility of developing these funding surgeries to include more information about other sources of funding.

ACW's RFO development Plan for 2014-15 includes capacity building and fundraising.

ACW recently provided information to Arts Branch on examples of successful bids to Trusts and Foundations made by a number of their RFOs.

Artworks Cymru, funded by Paul Hamlyn Foundation, has been a very successful project, which involves developing the skills of professionals working in participatory arts settings. ACW and Paul Hamlyn are supporting an extension of the project.

ACW is also supporting an older people's participatory project, in a funding partnership with the Baring Foundation.

Recommendation 7 (Accepted): The Arts Council of Wales should ensure that it uses its relationships with networks to ensure that information reaches relevant organisations.

Update: ACW has entered into a service agreement with VAW to deliver and expand "Running Your Group", a web based resource for voluntary arts organisations.

ACW continues to fund Disability Arts Cymru as one of its RFOs. ACW also continues to have a strong working relationship with Diverse Cymru and Age Concern.

The '*Creative Learning through the Arts Action Plan*', which arose from the Smith Review into Arts In Education, will make a major contribution towards this objective. The Plan involves a 5-year £20 million programme, with roll-out in schools from September 2015.

Recommendation 8 (Accepted): The Arts Council of Wales should put in place a strategy to increase levels of funding from business.

Update: ACW worked with the Welsh Government to secure the future of Arts and Business Cymru for 2014/15 -16. For next year A&BC has been invited to develop a business plan

involving less reliance on subsidy. Much rests on this, as it is the lead body for business sponsorship in the arts.

ACW has held various seminars involving eminent speakers under its Developing Resilience Programme, e.g. on leadership and philanthropy through technology.

ACW has given the DONATE platform a grant to adapt its online technology for Wales, NB to enable the use of the Welsh language.

ACW has provided a Digital R&D grant to an applicant looking to develop the technology for an online ticket levy for philanthropic purposes.

In its 'Sgwrs' events, ACW has run workshops on Crowd sourcing for audience development. ACW is also working with commercial and subsidised galleries to develop its '*Collectorplan*' scheme, to increase sales of art works.

Welsh Premier League

Recommendation 1 (Accepted): The FAW, Welsh Government and Sport Wales should develop a co-ordinated approach to developing football in Wales. The Minister for Sport should report back to the Assembly on the progress of discussions.

Update: The FAW will be launching a 2020 vision and strategic plan for football this summer “More than a game” setting out its ambitious goals for football after significant consultation with a broad range of key stakeholders. The document sets out 6 broad ambitious goals. WFT has launched its own corporate plan (2015-2020) to support its contribution towards the delivery of the overarching football strategy. Two of six key outcomes are ‘transforming communities through football for all’ and ‘a stronger and sustainable domestic game’. Sport Wales has provided 4 years in-principle support to the WFT based on the Corporate Plan and its ambitious goals, with the mission of supporting the delivery of the vision for football by growing the game and raising standards. Four key actions for the WFT are:

1. Identify, develop and prepare talented young players for international competition;
2. Ensure football has a well-trained and high performing voluntary and professional workforce to produce more and better players;
3. Grow the game through more accessible and flexible playing opportunities and to use the power of football to improve education, training and health outcomes for communities throughout Wales;
4. Aim to operate within our organisational values and achieve excellent customer service standards.

Recommendation 2 (Accepted): The FAW and Welsh Government should explore how the WPL clubs can support the delivery of broader policy objectives and the support that the clubs can access, financial or otherwise, to do so.

Update: In 2013 the FAW launched Project 3G which will see around £5m invested into 3G facilities at WPL clubs. The 3G pitch is the catalyst for the development of the ‘club is the hub’ model creating more sustainable clubs with a more professionalised workforce and increased community engagement. The applicant club must provide a robust business case prior to any investment and the FAW / WFT staff provide advice and support to the clubs in developing the business case. Staff are particularly involved in developing realistic usage plans which support the Welsh Football strategic aims of increasing participation and reducing inequality. Four projects have been completed to date and staff are involved in monitoring and supporting the progress of these facilities in order to protect and provide the best return on the investment. Five other projects are planned for 2016.

This is, in some ways, indirect engagement as the WG funds WFT through Sport Wales, however, it is having a direct impact on the sustained improvement at WPL clubs.

Recommendation 4 (Accepted in Principle): The Welsh Government should work with the FAW to develop a strategy to outline its vision for WPL clubs as community hubs, to ensure that the strategy supports the wider vision of supporting grassroots football and widening participation.

Update: This is set out in the 2020 strategy and is a key aim of the FAW funded Project 3G programme which aims to develop 3G pitches linked to WPL clubs.

Recommendation 5 (Accepted in Principle): The Welsh Government should develop a strategy for developing 3/4G pitches across Wales.

Update: The FAW, WFT and Hockey Wales have formed the Collaborative Sports Facilities Group and developed a joint strategic vision for the development of artificial pitches across Wales. An All Wales Vision and Guidance for Artificial Turf Pitches has been commissioned by this group which represents the Governing Bodies of Rugby, Football and Hockey in Wales. It was prepared to help inform the future approaches and decisions in Wales, of Local Authorities, Education Establishments, the National Governing Bodies and their Clubs and Sport Wales.

Recommendation 8 (Accepted): The FAW and Sport Wales should explore how the academy system can be used to support grassroots football.

Update: A review of Academies has been completed which will be considered by a joint Working Party including representatives from the FAW Community, National Game and International Boards.

Recommendation 9 (Accepted): The FAW and Sport Wales should explore whether additional financial assistance can be put in place to support young people who wish to play football, but who find it difficult to do so because of the financial demands (e.g. purchase of kit, travelling costs etc).

Update: Sport Wales has invested an additional £100k in the WFT this financial year to support the WFT regional investment plans. This plan is focused on tackling the higher level outcome 'transforming communities through football for all'. 2024 targets for this outcome are as follows:

- 50% of young people playing football once a week;
- 20000 registered female players;
- 30% of young people playing football at least twice a week – 60000 registered players;
- 1500 registered players with a disability;
- 4% of registered players from a BME background.

The future outlook for the media in Wales

Recommendation 2 (Accepted in Principle): The Welsh Government should commission a review to map the media needs of the people of Wales. This review should inform media policy across all sectors, including existing and developing technologies.

Update: The Welsh Government has engaged proactively with Ofcom to ensure that its reviews of communication markets and – most recently – its third review of Public Service Broadcasting provide in-depth analysis of media consumption, emerging trends and requirements, including at a Wales level. We have responded constructively and in detail to each consultation on these reports. This data provides a key baseline of information for Wales and informs ongoing policy development.

We have especially emphasised the need to improve governance arrangements and the accountability of the broadcasters, plus the need for the regulator to have a specific public policy duty in relation to the devolved governments of the UK. On both of these matters significant progress has been made within the last 12 months. Commitments to strengthen the Welsh Government's involvement in key appointments and to ensure that broadcasters are more accountable to the National Assembly were contained in the recent St. David's Day commend paper; and in Ofcom's latest Annual Plan it has now extended its public policy duty to include the devolved governments.

Recommendation 3 (Accepted): The Welsh Government should ensure that it engages fully and proactively in the Communications Bill process, to ensure that the Bill reflects the needs of Wales

Update: The Welsh Government took every opportunity to provide an input from a Welsh perspective. For example in the Welsh Government's response (September 2012) to the UK Government's Communications Review seminar *Supporting growth in the (audio) sector* we indicated that we would not wish to see further relaxation or removal of the current localness rules. We also noted that it was vital that there was an appropriate level of localness provision in particular local news.

Recommendation 4 (Accepted): The Welsh Government should continue to strengthen linkages across Government departments to ensure that the maximum benefit, economic and cultural, can be drawn from the media sectors.

Update: The Welsh Government has continued to work collaboratively across government departments. Since September 2014, broadcasting and creative industries are now both located within the same portfolio.

Recommendation 5 (Accepted): As part of its role, the independent forum should keep under review the issue of the devolution of broadcasting in Wales and advise the Welsh Government as appropriate.

Update: The UK Government has not offered to devolve any aspects of broadcasting policy.

The Welsh Government response to the Silk 2 report noted that its recommendation on the devolution of the DCMS element of funding of S4C carried risks, unless it was accompanied by

strong safeguards about the continued overall funding of the channel, including in the context of changes to the way the BBC is funded after 2017, following charter renewal. The UK Government's St David's Day Command Paper noted that there was no consensus on devolving responsibility for the UK Government funding for S4C to the Welsh Government. This was in line with our initial evidence to the Silk Commission.

Recommendation 6 (Accepted): The Welsh Government should develop a protocol with the UK Government for dealing with broadcasting issues which are not devolved.

Update: The Welsh Government's concordat with DCMS covering all non devolved policy matters including broadcasting is still in existence. In addition, on a case by case basis the Welsh Government works closely with the UK Government to formalise involvement in significant issues (e.g., the development of a Memorandum of Understanding that will set out how the Welsh Government will participate in the review of the BBC's Royal Charter).

Recommendation 10 (Accepted): The Welsh Government should make representations to the UK Government and Ofcom for the current Channel 3 licence provisions to be the minimum requirement for renewal of the licence.

Update: As reflected in our response to the Ofcom consultation in 2013 on the Channel 3 licence, the Welsh Government does not view the existing level of provision as appropriate, or even adequate; it is a minimum standard that barely manages to deliver against very basic Public Service Broadcasting requirements. Protecting the existing coverage provision should have been the minimum condition for renewal of the Channel 3 licence. We would like to see an increase in provision and this is reflected in our Programme for Government. We believe that increasing the provision is appropriate, especially considering ITV plc's current healthy financial position.

Recommendation 11 (Accepted in Principle): The Welsh Government should explore opportunities, at an appropriate time, for the introduction of a Wales-specific Channel 3 licence.

Update: We welcomed the creation of a separate Channel 3 licence for Wales which we believe should reflect Welsh identity in both name and output, as is the case with the equivalent Channel 3 licences in Scotland and Northern Ireland. We were disappointed that the opportunity was not taken to strengthen the terms of the licence, both to guarantee a higher level of service provision for Wales and to protect that service in the event of any change of ownership, but we remain committed to a constructive dialogue with Ofcom and ITV to maximise the impact of the licence in Wales.

Recommendation 12(Accepted): The Welsh Government should explore ways to work more effectively with Channel 4 to support Welsh companies.

Update: The Welsh Government strongly believes that if Channel 4 receives public funding then it should be required to produce at least a population share of network commissions in the nations and regions. This is fully in conformity with Channel 4's role in developing new talent throughout the UK. We were disappointed that Ofcom did not agree with our view, as reflected in our response to its consultation in 2014, that the Channel 4 quota for Out of London productions should be implemented by 2016 rather than 2020. It is still our view that Channel 4 should be able to achieve the new quota level significantly before the 2020 deadline.

Channel 4's record in commissioning content from Wales has historically been negligible; Channel 4 spend in Wales remains below 1% of total Channel 4 content spend and the broadcaster, which is based in Scotland, has no commissioning staff in Wales. This should be

seen in the context of its existing target for Out of England TV production, which for some time has been 3% and has recently been amended to 9% by 2020. When Channel 4 launched its 4IP on-line initiatives to develop community-based news and public service facilities online, considerable efforts were made in Wales to attract a share in the programme, but without success.

The Welsh Government worked successfully with Channel 4 on the Alpha Fund. This was a useful starting point for the development of a more strategic relationship with Channel 4. Ultimately we would like to see a permanent Channel 4 presence in Wales.

The Deputy Minister for Culture, Sport and Tourism and David Abraham, the Chief Executive of Channel 4, have corresponded on these matters and met in Cardiff to discuss them further in June 2015. Following a positive meeting Mr Abraham was introduced to a number of Welsh producers and had a constructive dialogue about developing Channel 4's working relationships in Wales.

Recommendation 13 (Accepted): The Welsh Government should keep under review the impact of budget cuts on the independent television production sector and identify new ways of providing the sector with advice and support.

Update: The Welsh Government has been clear about its concerns in relation to the impact of budget cuts affecting BBC Cymru Wales and S4C, plus the potential the impact of changes to commissioning and the approach to developing productions by the large broadcasters. These concerns include the potential threat to jobs and growth in the independent sub-sector, from which both broadcasters commission a significant number of productions. The Welsh Government has proactively engaged with Ofcom in recent years to ensure that licence conditions for the broadcasters protect the interests of Welsh viewers and businesses as much as possible, and continues to engage closely with the UK Government on key issues such as the current of the BBC's Royal Charter, which could have significant implications for Wales.

The Welsh Government's Creative Industries sector team focuses on supporting the television supply chain in Wales, through networking events and the ongoing development of initiatives to improve and embed key skills (e.g., the recent, successful pilot scheme based at Bay Studios in Swansea, which allowed talented individuals to shadow leading experts in key TV production roles where we have a capacity shortfall in Wales, allowing them to gain the skills and experience needed to full these roles in Wales). The Wales Screen location and crew service provides an important, continually improving, service which helps to ensure that productions deliver as cost effectively as possible in Wales, using the best talent available. Additionally, the Welsh Government runs the Creative Europe desk in Wales, which advises companies, including independent producers, about applying for funding from the Creative Europe programme.

Recommendation 14 (Accepted): The Welsh Government should continue to make representations to the UK Government to ensure 97% coverage in Wales before digital switchover

Update: The Welsh Government has consistently stressed to the UK Government that one of the fundamental criteria driving digital radio switchover should be that the coverage in Wales is no less than that in the rest of the UK. We have pressed for there to be at least 97% coverage for DAB throughout Wales.

The Welsh Government welcomed the announcement in December 2013 that there will be continued investment by the UK Government, as well as the BBC and commercial radio, in support of digital radio roll out. However, we remain concerned that even when the proposed

criteria are met on a UK basis, there would almost certainly be a significantly lower level of DAB penetration in Wales.

Recommendation 15 (Accepted): The Welsh Government should explore all opportunities to continue to support community radio in Wales.

Update: The Welsh Government believes that community radio provides a key service for local residents, reflecting the issues affecting people and their communities. For this reason we set up the Community Radio Fund in 2007. From April 2008 to March 2014 the Welsh Government distributed £100,000 per year to community radio stations in Wales.

Due to pressure on budgets across the Welsh Government and difficult decisions having to be made, it was not possible for the Community Radio Fund to continue post March 2014. The final year of the Community Radio Fund was to have been 2012/13 but an extension was granted and the Fund continued for a further twelve months to allow community radio stations to investigate alternative sources of funding for April 2014 and beyond. The Fund ended finally in March 2014

Although the Fund has come to an end we continue to recognise the importance of community radio stations in providing a valuable service for local residents.

Recommendation 16 (Accepted): The Welsh Government should make representations to the UK Government to include specific Welsh language duties for Ofcom in the Communications Bill.

Update: As part of the Communications Review process between 2011 and 2013, the Welsh Government informed DCMS that we would not wish to see further relaxation or removal of the current localness rules. In particular we expressed our wish for any new legislation to include a commitment for commercial radio stations to reflect the language of local communities. Under the existing legislation commercial radio stations are not obliged in their output to reflect the language of local communities unless such a condition is included in the licences. This issue, of course, was a factor in the discussions in relation to Ofcom's Welsh Language Scheme.

Recommendation 18 (Accepted in Principle): The Welsh Government should ensure that it is in a position to engage with newspaper companies so that viable measures can be put in place when it becomes apparent that either significant numbers of jobs are to be lost, or newspapers are going to be closed.

Update: The Welsh Government's Creative Industries sector team supports all sub-sectors, including newspapers and publishing. As one example, the Welsh Government supported Newsquest in order to secure the opening of a Wales HQ in Newport, bringing a significant number of jobs in the print media industry into the area.

Additionally, we are well aware of issues pertaining to the online transition of news services from print to online and engage with stakeholders at a national and local level to identify ways in which the Welsh Government may be able to support the economic viability of the industry as these changes move forward.

Recommendation 19 (Accepted in Principle): The Welsh Government should continue to progress the recommendations of the Hargreaves review, and report back to the Communities, Equality and Local Government Committee regularly on progress.

Update: Most of the Hargreaves recommendations were implemented. The Welsh Government has moved on from the Hargreaves Review and is now focused on the policy direction recommended by the current Creative Industries Sector Panel and accepted by the Welsh Government. These policies have created a clear and coherent plan that prioritises delivering support for the commercial creative sector and, as the economic statistics show, Wales is having significant success in its creative economy.

Recommendation 20 (Accept): The Welsh Government should do more to communicate to stakeholders the purpose and role of its Creative Industries Sector panel.

Update: The Welsh Government has held a number of events over the last year where stakeholders were given the opportunity to meet panel members, as well as Pinewood executives and the sector team. The evidence collected by the Welsh Government demonstrates that traditional media production is still an important part of the economic picture in Wales, but that digital media is also crucial to economic success as a fast growing subsector and therefore requires government intervention too. The Welsh Government's attention to digital media as well as traditional media led to the creation of the Digital Development Fund. Half of Digital Week 2015's 'Digital Dozen', which are businesses chosen as exemplars for digital innovation, had received support from this fund.

Recommendation 21 (Accepted): The Welsh Government should explore opportunities, including working with higher education institutions, to encourage innovation and foster new business models.

Update: The Welsh Government's strategy, *Innovation Wales*, is published and is being used to guide policy & investments. The strategy calls for a broad definition of innovation including supporting social innovation and the creative industries. Since the report, EST has supported the private sector to develop business accommodation which is amenable to the creative & cultural sectors, namely, a branch of TechHub in Swansea & Welsh ICE in Caerphilly.

An Open Innovation programme has been developed which enables Anchor companies and smaller companies to collaborate on commercially exploitable projects and develop new business models.

WEPSIN was awarded £220k by Welsh Government's Academic Expertise for Business programme, to build on the success achieved by Welsh athletes in the Delhi 2010 Commonwealth Games and London Olympics 2012. The initiative supported the goals for the Commonwealth Games in Glasgow 2014 and will support the Olympic Games in Rio 2016 and beyond. The network is a mix of experts in the areas of Sport, Academia and Industry, forming a unique knowledge exchange forum to improve the performance of both Welsh sport and business.

The University of South Wales secured £50,000 of Academic Expertise for Business A4B funding via the Welsh Government. A4B funding enabled the University to work with Welsh elite athletes preparing for the commonwealth Games and to test and develop new protocols and peripherals.

Recommendation 22 (Accepted): The Welsh Government should monitor proposals by the UK Government to change laws relating to intellectual property rights and should make representations to the UK Government that any changes should be suitable to the needs of Wales.)

Update: The Welsh Government acknowledges that companies in the creative sector need to understand intellectual property and is exploring options to provide quality advice on best practice and opportunities in this and other areas.

Recommendation 23 (Accepted): The Welsh Government should develop a strategic approach to the provision of training, to sit alongside its other policies, including the Digital Wales Delivery Plan.

Update: Significant investment has been made to the provision of training for the sector. Much of this work has been undertaken by the Sector Skills Councils – Creative Skillset Cymru and Creative & Cultural Skills - in partnership with other sector bodies.

Creative Skillset Cymru received three separate Sector Priority Fund Programme (SPFP) projects that had a combined value of £1.1m.

Apprenticeship in Creative and Digital Media

Level 4 Apprenticeship in Creative and Digital Media - Interactive and Digital Media Pathway. This project has coordinated the delivery of a Level 4 Apprenticeship in Interactive and Digital Media. Apprentices have had the opportunity to begin their creative and digital media careers with companies.

Apprenticeship in Fashion and Textiles

Creative Skillset have co-ordinated the delivery of a Level 2 and 3 Apprenticeship in Fashion and Textiles in Wales. The qualification offered a range of pathways that enable the qualifications to be specific and relevant to the sector in Wales.

Creative Provision

Creative Provision developed the quality of the educational provision within Further and Higher Education in Wales. This is linked to Creative Skillset's programme of industry endorsing courses. The aim of the project was to support industry intervention into curriculum content and design and to drive employer and education engagement.

Skills for the Digital Economy (SfDE)

The SfDE Programme was devised in 2010 in response to The Heart of Digital Wales report (Hargreaves, 2009). The programme developed and delivered flexible, industry-led training of creative media employers and freelancers working or living in West Wales, the Valleys and North West Wales. This four and a half year programme was supported by the European Social Fund

DfES business skills and training support is available to digital media businesses as it is to other Welsh businesses.

